Values in nursing and the virtues of the profession: a systematic critical review

Dimitrios Kosmidis, Sotiria Koutsouki, Dimitrios Theofanidis

Published in cooperation with the Postgraduate Program "Intensive Care Units", the Hellenic Society of Nursing Research and Education and the Helerga

To cite this article:

VALUES IN NURSING AND THE VIRTUES OF THE PROFESSION: A SYSTEMATIC CRITICAL REVIEW

Dimitrios Kosmidis[1], Sotiria Koutsouki[2], Dimitrios Theofanidis[3]

1. RN, PhD, General Hospital of Kavala, Greece
2. RN, PhD(c) General Hospital of Kavala, Greece
3. Assistant Professor PhD, Nursing Department, International Hellenic University, Greece

Abstract

Introduction: Values are the cornerstone of routine nursing practice. Yet, there is lack of clarity and controversies over the content of the term and its application in contemporary nursing practice.

Aim: The main aim of this discussion paper to explore the concept of 'values' in nursing, provide insights into their application with specific relevance to nursing and contemplate on its consequences on contemporary nursing practice.

Methodology: For this paper's needs a critical literature search was undertaken within the past two decades whereby key terms and corresponding contexts were critically appraised with regards to the concepts involved. Search terms used included: nursing, values, deontology, caring, in both Pubmed and Greek databases. The Cohen's Kappa coefficient was used in order to assess inter-rater reliability.

Results & Discussion: After close perusal, the search yielded 55 papers with a distinct content on values in contemporary nursing. These were categorized in 5 distinct subthemes i.e. *Ethical and individual values, Professional values and virtues, The development of values, Integrity* and *Dignity* which were subsequently addressed and discussed further. Cohen's Kappa was 0.85 (95% CI:0.776-0.922) reflecting a strong level of agreement among the two authors.

Discussion: Professional values can be seen as tools that encourage nurses to become ethically sensitive professionals. Various studies on professional values in different countries have shown that the difference in the adoption and weight given to professional values is mainly due to the priorities given, rather than their nature per se. Ethical values significantly influence the scope of nursing practice, the way nurses think and act and consequently the care they provide with integrity and dignity being at the core of their practice delivery.

Conclusions: Values in nursing science should be developed primarily by direct learning in basic education through raising awareness among nurses regarding ethics and the value of nursing. Integrity and respect for dignity are referred to as two of the most basic values which may affect both nursing practice and care providers. The way nurses behave is a reflection of their knowledge, experience, ability, personality and judgment. This reflects the professionalism of nurses based on agreed common values.

Keywords: Values, nursing, deontology, caring.

Corresponding Author: Dimitrios Kosmidis RN, PhD, General Hospital of Kavala, Greece

INTRODUCTION

'Values' is a term that has received great attention and emphasis in the international health care debate in an attempt to ensure that nurses have the 'right' values. Ever since the Nightingale era, ethics and professional values have been a fundamental element of the nursing profession.[1] Ethical and professional nursing values are a framework and serve as a model that guides both social and professional nursing practices and behaviors.[2] In this review an attempt is made to understand what the 'values' in nursing are as well as an analysis of their existence in contemporary nursing care delivery.

Before analyzing and trying to explain the term 'values', it is important to note that in order to achieve optimum patient care, nurses must first recognize and understand their own professional values.[3] According to Willis: "*The development of a successful workforce depends on providing the necessary skills, attitudes and values*".[4] Skills are measurable activities through competencies but behavior and values are less measurable concepts in their scope for benchmarking. Horton et al.,[5] provide a detailed interpretation of the concept 'value', pointing out that: "*Values determine the beliefs and actions of an individual ...*" and that... "*Values guide the priorities with which we live and shape our existence in the world*." Thus, values are a contemplative concept and as such can be further explored by elaborating on similar terms used in relation to nursing. Many authors cite terms that are frequently used in the literature of values in nursing and argue that these are often considered the origin and basis of social behavior.

The terms that have been associated with 'values' are 'responsibility', 'compassion', 'honesty', 'truth', 'dignity', 'altruism', 'autonomy', 'adequacy', 'trust', 'reliability', 'integrity', 'empowerment', 'kindness', 'confidentiality', 'empathy', 'ethics', 'courage' and 'judgment'. Some authors have dealt with "values in nursing" by solely focusing on the professional drives rather than core ethical values of nursing.[6] In a study in Japan, authors analyzed the value of 'harmony' in nursing and suggested it as one of the most fundamental value within the context of their society.[7] Verpeet, considers values as reflecting the responsibility of nurses towards patients, the profession, other members of healthcare team and society in general.[8] In defining the components of human dignity, Naden & Eriksson[9] suggested 'bravery', 'responsibility', 'respect', 'commitment' and 'moral desires'. Yet, Tarlier[10] argues that in designing a code of ethics for nursing, 'respect for patients' has the highest priority and is one of the three key elements along with 'reliability' and 'reciprocity'. In the study of Rchaidia et al.,[11] the authors also state that the detection of moral values is the basis for the creation of codes of conduct.

Shih et al., in their study on the perspectives of professional values among nurses in Taiwan suggested that the majority of those surveyed cited 'care' and 'altruism' as the most common nursing values. Other values were 'providing holistic professional and appropriate care', 'developing personal and professional competence', 'disease prevention', 'promoting health', 'promoting interpersonal communication skills' and 'receiving a fair reward'.[12] Weis & Schank through factor analysis, devised eight factors for professional values, the most important of which was the role of nurses in care and the dimension of commitment.[13]

Pang et al.,[14] in their study in China, concluded with seven professional values of nursing i.e. 'altruism', 'care', 'respect for dignity', 'trust', 'responsibility', 'independence' and 'justice'. Furthermore, other studies have proposed five professional values in nursing education, i.e.: 'altruism', 'independence', 'respect for dignity', 'integrity of nursing interventions' and 'social justice'.[15,16]

AIM

The main aim of this paper was to explore the concept of 'values' in nursing, provide insights into their application with specific relevance to nursing and contemplate on its consequences on contemporary nursing practice.

METHODOLOGY

For this paper's needs a systematic literature search was under-

taken within the past two decades whereby key terms and corresponding contexts were critically appraised with regard to the concepts involved. Search terms used included: nursing, values, deontology, caring, in Pubmed, CINAHL and Greek databases and inclusion criteria were as follows:

- publication within 2000-2020,
- full text available,
- content in English or in Greek,
- text containing a clear and concise definition of ethical values in nursing practice
- manuscript relating exclusively to nursing ethical values.

Statistical analysis

As this was a critical-discussion paper based on a systematic literature review and not a meta-analysis, a Bayesian random effects model was not used nor any tests for assessing heterogeneity as the studies found were very diverse in terms of sample and intervention applied. Thus, as heterogeneity of research designs and paper content impeded a quantitative analysis, a descriptive synthesis was performed instead. Yet, in order to achieve some degree of study validity, and assure consistency among the data handlers (both authors) the Cohen's Kappa coefficient was used in order to assess inter-rater reliability. Therefore, the team of the paired reviewers identified eligible papers, appraised their methodological suitability and overall quality and abstracted their content with pretested forms. Hence, Cohen's Kappa was 0.85 (95% CI:0.776-0.922) reflecting a strong level of agreement among the two authors.

Furthermore, once the final number of references was agreed upon i.e. n=55, and in an attempt to achieve study reliability, the Cohen's Kappa was used again to calculate inter-rater agreement in terms of coding the papers concerning taxonomy in the categories that emerged during analysis. In this case, Cohen's Kappa K was 0.85 (95% CI:0.798-0.933) and again low variability was secured between the two coders (i.e., the authors). The statistical analysis was performed via the Stata v.16 statistical package.

RESULTS & DISCUSSION

From 36991 initial references, 354 full text articles were closely reviewed. Of these, 55 originating from 9 countries met the inclusion criteria (Table 1) as they yielded a distinct content on values in contemporary nursing. These were subsequently categorized in 5 distinct subthemes (Table 2) which were consequently addressed and discussed further i.e.:

- *Ethical and individual values*,
- *Professional values and virtues*,
- *The development of values*,
- *Integrity* and
- *Dignity*

Ethical and individual values

Ethical values significantly influence the scope of nursing practice, the way nurses think and act and consequently the care they provide. In this context Jormsri et al. claim that "*ethics is the application of an individual's values*".[17] However, Horton et al., define ethics as the distinction between good and bad or right and wrong and emphasize that the terms ethics and values, although different, are often used in conjunction with each other.[5] Since individual values and beliefs influence thinking and attitudes towards people and therefore individual values automatically become an important professional element of nursing.

Nurses as professionals, aim to strengthen the care relationship between themselves and their patients. Within this context the most important principle is to provide quality care which requires among other things respect for the patient's moral values and beliefs.

Professional values and virtues

Professional values can be seen as tools that encourage nurses to become ethically sensitive professionals. Professional values are reflected in the international and national codes of practice and morality such as the International Council of Nursing code of ethics, the code of ethics in nursing in Canada, the code of the Council of Nursing and Obstetrics of England, the Code of Nursing Ethics in Greece, and more. [18-21] These codes essentially describe the basic values and framework that should be adopted in routine nursing care. Some of the values described as care,

compassion, ability, communication, courage and commitment are also personal qualities.

Beauchamp and Childress proposed six fundamental virtues which are necessary in nursing care, i.e.: 'care', 'compassion', 'discretion', 'trust', 'integrity', and 'consciousness'.[22] These qualities are endorsed by more authors such as Hawley and Baillie & Black.[23,24] The interaction between nurses and patients must hold characteristics of a therapeutic relationship and must be based on equality, mutual respect and willingness to cooperate. However, this interaction has the main focus on the patient and as a result of this the healthcare practitioner's requirements of moral standing are such that they may sometimes be in conflict and may not be able to respond adequately. The particular role of the nurse suggests that many of the virtues cannot simply be desired but are essential for the exercise of their profession.

However, virtues cannot be imposed as obligations on the carer's professional conduct as they are not intrinsic elements of the individual but characteristics that can be cultivated. Some values such as 'competence', 'courage' and 'self-control' and 'communication' are inherent in professional behavior. Communication is essential for a relationship of trust with patients, and to establish an effective and successful relationship with colleagues. At the same time, communication needs to be based on honesty and integrity. A nurse who makes a mistake in the patient's hospitalization or fails to take good care of a patient faces the challenge of disclosing the situation to colleagues, supervisor and the wider clinical environment or ignoring it, hiding it or even falsifying the truth.

Honesty and integrity in this case would require the nurse to openly acknowledge one's failure to correct the situation even if it causes detrimental consequences for them. This recognition of failure requires courage, while concealment indicates a lack of courage, dishonesty and lack of integrity of the character. This means that integrity is a core virtue in the nursing profession. Laabsdescribes the nurse with integrity as the one who is honest and trustworthy in what he does but also the one who defends what is right despite the consequences.[25] Other ethical values

such as respect for the patient often involves the nurse professionally in terms of diagnosis, prognosis and therapeutic interventions. Honesty and respect must be values infused in the caring professions as health care workers must be prepared to deal with many complex situations, ethical dilemmas and internal ethical conflicts.[26]

Professional values are based on personal values, which are influenced by family, culture, environment, religion and nationality. The process of acquiring such values is gradual and evolutionary and takes place throughout a person's lifetime. Nurses, as the largest group of health care workforce, must show that they adhere to core professional values.[27] The use of these values in nursing practice has been shown to increase the quality of patient care, professional satisfaction for nurses and their commitment to optimum nursing care.[28] Professional values are a source of promoting the moral skills of nurses in clinical environments and addressing complex ethical issues in contemporary times.[29] Most nurses are aware of ethical issues, but do not give the necessary attention in incorporating them into everyday clinical practice. Moreover, in many cases, some may not have sufficient inner strength or external support to show their commitment in adhering to all these values.[30]

Professional values often provide solutions to the current problems in the healthcare profession. Nowadays, globalization, migration, a lack of nursing personnel, new and evolving diseases, the rising proportion of the elderly and frail populations and the demand for high-quality sophisticated care and often limited resources are issues that lead to additional ethical problems for nurses.[31] Within this context, the current Covid-19 pandemic has projected all these issues to the forefront of decision making. Consequently, when faced with ethical dilemmas, especially within extreme circumstances, nurses should always adhere to and display core professional values in their decision making.

The development of values

The development of values means in principle that they are not inherent but cultivated. Although values tend to be stable, they can change or develop. Values have cognitive, emotional and

behavioral elements. They include what a person believes or feel is desirable, but also the action arising from these thoughts and emotions.

Understanding people's beliefs and values leads to understanding of their behavior and to respect them as individuals. Nurses must be sensitive to beliefs and values and respond with respect. Values are usually acquired through both direct and indirect learning which can include imitation, observation and adoption of other people's styles and attitudes. Academic education can provide a first step to understanding these attributes and raise relevant awareness. Further development of professional values for nurses may be influenced mainly by high caliber co-professionals, lived situations during patient care and also values which have already been developed and are explicitly displayed within an organization.[32]

Various studies on professional values in different countries have shown that the difference in the adoption and weight given to professional values is mainly due to the priorities given, rather than their nature per se. These studies have pointed out that the difference in priorities may be due to cultural, social, economic and religious circumstances. In Rassin's study on a sample of 58 men and 265 women in Israel, it was shown that priorities in values were different among nursing students from different ethnicities.[33] Yet, no significant differences were found in occupational values by gender. By contrast, Martin et al., using the Nurses Professional Value Scale (NPVS) tool in a sample of 183 men and 1,248 female graduates, found men's scores significantly and consistently lower than women's.[34] NPVS is a 26-item Likert scale, that assesses values derived from the American Nursing Association code of conduct for nursing.[35] Using the same tool, Astorino found a sample of 15 male nursing graduates with scores lower in professional values than women.[36] Lui et al., reported significant differences in a single value (maintaining the professional image) in a sample of 31 men and 232 female nursing students in Hong Kong. Men have achieved higher results than women for this value.[37] Shahriari et al's., study on Iranian nurses, showed that due to their religious beliefs, nurses placed greater emphasis on the value of the dignity of patients.[6]

In addition, it appears that nurses unfortunately have low knowledge and awareness of their professional values.

In particular, they do not use commonly known nursing values to shape their moral thinking but rather are based merely on personal experiences or the dominant culture of the workplace.[38,39] This demonstrates a need to strengthen basic knowledge, reinforce information to raise awareness among nurses of core professional values, particularly in clinical environments. This would also help healthcare managers to understand the different professional value systems within the workforce and thus create a more appropriate working environment.[40]

Integrity

Integrity is considered to be a highly desirable quality for professionals. Customarily, trust and integrity go together and are mentioned in the code of Nursing and Midwifery Council with the following statement: "*You must maintain the reputation of your profession at any time. You should demonstrate a personal commitment to the standard of practice and behavior set out in the code. You must be a model of integrity and leadership for others…*"[41] Integrity as a multidimensional concept has multiple interpretations.[42] In a philosophical sense, the term integrity is quite complex because it includes several abstract concepts like self, identity and social virtues.[43,44] It also includes all aspects of a person's life, such as personal-professional values and aspirations, along with social and moral behavior entities.[45]

Thus, integrity is considered to be one of the basic values of the medical and paramedical professions.[46] The complex and dynamic nature of the nursing workload requires not only sufficient clinical skills but also certain personal qualities such as social and moral awareness as part of personal integrity.[47] However, the terms 'integrity', 'personal integrity' and 'professional integrity' should be clarified further. The concept of 'integrity' is tacitly a personal concept.[48] Thus, the term 'integrity' and 'personal integrity' are identical and both refer to the basic integrity of the individual. Professional integrity on the other hand is an area of personal integrity which applies to professional life, so

personal-professional integrity is interlinked.[43]

However, personal values and professional values may conflict, adding complexity to the conception of personal-professional integrity. Despite the fact that integrity is highly valued in nursing care, there is no consensus on the definition of integrity. Therefore, the concept of integrity in nursing practice tends to be understood through individual values such as: honesty, moral behavior and a high level of professionalism.[49]

Yet, such interpretations may be misleading and may reduce the value of integrity. Tyreman suggests that integrity should be considered within a social context that entails a more complex interaction between different entities and not just an independent element.[48] Indeed, making excuses for lack of integrity of a challenged individual or of an unexpected isolated behavior can devalue and thus limit the true power of integrity for the nursing profession.

In a recent study by Sastrawan et al., two major concepts of integrity have been recognized. These included a sense of completeness in terms of personal-professional concerns and ethical behavior. The authors also identified six interlinked elements that may pose threats to integrity i.e.: 'personality', 'patients', 'teamwork', 'working culture', 'nature of work' and 'the organization'. They also identified two key strategies that nurses use when their integrity is threatened: adjustment and compensation[50]. The threat to the integrity of nurses arises when there is an undeniable gap between the expectation and reality they are experiencing. While the expectation comes from the nurse, the reality is shaped by the complex and varied interference that occurs in the healthcare workforce. Maintaining integrity requires a constant effort to strike a balance between personal expectations, professional concerns and the reality of nursing.

Dignity

Dignity is a human right and is important for every person, but it can be put at risk during healthcare delivery. The treatment of patients with dignity and their involvement in decision-making is associated with positive results, such as high patient satisfaction.[51] In a review of the World Health Organization (WHO) in 41 countries, most participants chose dignity as the second most important element in care delivery. Only 'timely care' had a higher score.[52]

Yet, not all patients have decent care experiences. This is especially so for the elderly and those with learning difficulties. Although all healthcare staff has a duty to treat people with dignity, nurses are especially exposed to patients that are vulnerable. It is therefore nurses who have a significant influence on whether and to what extent patients believe their dignity is preserved during their care. Although the word dignity is often used, particularly in relation to healthcare, it is often described as an ambiguous concept.[53.54]

In 2008, the Royal College of Nursing (RCN) published a definition of dignity based on a bibliographical review as a directive on nursing practice. The definition particularly emphasizes that dignity applies to people regardless of their abilities. In relation to the loss of dignity, those who are most vulnerable may be people who do not have the ability to make their own decisions independently, for example, a person who is unconscious or has advanced dementia or severe learning disabilities.[55]

Dignity is about how people feel, think and behave in relation to their value of themselves and others. Treating someone with dignity means treating them as a worthy existence and in a way that respects them as a precious person. When there is dignity, people feel they have control that they have value, they have confidence, and they can easily make decisions concerning themselves. When dignity is lacking, individuals feel underestimated, lose confidence, and subsequently may not be able to make constructive decisions concerning themselves. They may even feel humiliated or ashamed. Most people aspire to be of high value and thus should be treated with respect to how they feel, think and behave in relation to their own self value perception regardless of the abilities they actually have.

CONCLUSIONS

The role of the nurse is closely linked to exercising both personal and professional values. These are intertwined in the literature

on both health care delivery in general and the nursing profession per se. The terms of the various values linked to the profession of nursing have been discussed in detail but do not share a common accepted priority and precise content due to various influencing factors and changing circumstances.

Values should be developed primarily by direct learning in early basic nursing education through raising awareness of their importance. Integrity and dignity are referred to as two of the most basic values which affect both nursing practice and nurses themselves. The way nurses behave is a reflection of their knowledge, experience, ability, personality and judgment. This in turn reflects on the professionalism of nurses collectively, based on agreed common values within their working environments.

REFERENCES

1. Kangasniemi M, Pakkanen P, Korhonen A. Professional ethics in nursing: An integrative review. Journal of Advanced Nursing 2015; 71(8):1744–1757.

2. Sibandze BT, Scafide KN. Among nurses, how does education level impact professional values? A systematic review. Int Nurs Rev 2018; 65(1):65-77.

3. Moon S, et al. Evaluation of the validity and reliability of the Korean version of the Nursing Professional Values Scale-Revised. Nurse Education Today 2014; 34(3):325–330.

4. Willis L. Health Education England. Raising the bar – shape of caring: a review of the future education and training of registered nurses and care assistants. England, Health Education. 2015. Available at: https://www.hee.nhs.uk/sites/default/files/documents/2348-Shape-of-caring-review-FINAL.pdf Accessed 13 May 2020.

5. Horton K, Tschudin V, Forget A. The value of nursing: a literature review. Nurs Ethics 2007;14(6):716–740.

6. Shahriari M, Mohammadi E, Abbaszadeh A, Bahrami M. Nursing ethical values and definitions: A literature review. Iran J Nurs Midwifery Res 2013; 18(1):1-8.

7. Konishi E, Yahiro M, Nakajima N, Ono M, authors. The Japanese value of harmony and nursing ethics. Nurs Ethics 2009; 16:625–36.

8. Verpeet E, Meulenbergs T, Gastmans C, authors. Professional values and norms for nurses in Belgium. Nurs Ethics 2003; 10:654–65.

9. Naden D, Eriksson K.. Understanding the importance of values and moral attitudes in nursing care in preserving human dignity. Nurs Sci Q 2004; 17:86–91.

10. Tarlier DS. Beyond caring: The moral and ethical bases of responsive nurse patient relationships. Nurs Philos 2004;5: 230–41.

11. Rchaidia L, Dierckx de Casterle B, De Blaeser L, Gastmans C. Cancer patients' perceptions of the good nurse: A literature review. Nurs Ethics 2009;16:528–42.

12. Shih FJ, Lin YS, Smith MC, Liou YM, Chiang HH, Lee SH, et al. Perspectives on professional values among nurses in Taiwan. J Clin Nurs 2009; 18:1480–9.

13. Weis D, Schank MJ. An instrument to measure professional nursing values. J Nurs Scholarsh 2000;32:201–4.

14. Pang D, Senaratana W, Kunaviktikul W, Klunklin A, McElmurry B. Nursing values in China: The expectations of registered nurses. Nurs Health Sci 2009;11:312–7.

15. Shaw H, Degazon C. Integrating the core professional values of nursing: A profession, not just a career. J Cult Divers 2008;15:44–50.

16. Fahrenwald NL, Bassett SD, Tschetter L, Carson PP, White L, Winterboer VJ. Teaching core nursing values. J Prof Nurs 2005;21:46–51.

17. Jormsri P, Kunaviktikul W, Ketefian S, Chaowalit D. A moral competence in nursing practice. Nurs Ethics 2005; 12:582–594.

18. International Council of Nurses. The ICN Code of Ethics. Geneva, Switzerland. 2012. Available at: https://www.icn.ch/sites/default/files/inline-files/2012_ICN_Codeofethicsfornurses_%20eng.pdf Accessed 20 July 2020.

19. Canadian Nurses Association. Code of ethics for registered nurses. 2017. Available at: https://www.cna-aiic.ca/~/media/cna/page-content/pdf-en/code-of-ethics-2017-edition Accessed 17 June 2020.

20. Nursing and Midwifery Council. The code – professional standards of practice and behavior for nurses and midwives. NMC, London. 2018. Available at: https://www.nmc.org.uk/globalassets/sitedocuments/nmc-publications/nmc-code.pdf Accessed 2 June 2020.

21. Code of Nursing Deontology (Greece). P.D.216/2001 - FEK 167/A/25-7-2001.

22. Beauchamp TL, Childress JF. Principles of biomedical ethics, 7th ed. New York: Oxford University Press; 2013.

23. Hawley G. Ethics in clinical practice: an interprofessional approach. Pearson Education: Harlow; 2007.

24. Baillie L, Black S. Professional values in nursing. London: CRC Press; 2015.

25. Laabs C. Perceptions of moral integrity: contradictions in need of explanation. Nurs Ethics, 2011; 18(3):431-40.

26. Koutsouki S., Kosmidis D. The phenomenon of Moral Distress in Nursing Practice. Nosileftiki 2012; 51(4): 354–363.

27. Poorchangizi B, Farokhzadian J, Abbaszadeh A, Mirzaee M, Borhani F. The importance of professional values from clinical nurses' perspective in hospitals of a medical university in Iran. BMC Med Ethics, 2017; 18(1):20.

28. Shahriari M, Mohammadi E, Abbaszadeh A, Bahrami M, Fooladi M. Perceived ethical values by Iranian nurses. Nurs Ethics 2012;19(1):30–44.

29. Martin P, Yarbrough S, Alfred D. Professional values held by baccalaureate and associate degree nursing students. J Nurs Scholarsh 2003; 35(3):291-296.

30. Leners DW, Roehrs C, Piccone AV. Tracking the development of professional values in undergraduate nursing students. J Nurs Educ 2006; 45(12):504-11.

31. Seada A, Fathi Sleem W. Professional socialization process and acquisition of professional nursing values among undergraduate nursing students. J Am Sci 2012; 8(4):678–83.

32. Bang KS, Kang JH, Jun MH, Kim HS, Son HM, Yu SJ, et al. Professional values in Korean undergraduate nursing students. Nurse Educ Today 2011; 31(1):72–75.

33. Rassin RM. Values grading among nursing students–Differences between the ethnic groups. Nurse Educ Today 2010; 30(5):458–63.

34. Martin P, Yarbrough S, Alfred D. Professional values held by baccalaureate and associate degree nursing students. Journal of Nursing Scholarship 2003; 35(3): 291-296.

35. Weis D, Schank MJ. Development and psychometric evaluation of the Nurses Professional Values Scale-Revised. Journal of Nursing Measurement 2009; 17(3): 221-231.

36. Astorino T. A.. A survey of professional values in graduating student nurses of traditional and accelerated nursing programs. Doctoral dissertation. 2006 Available at: https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/9acc/1f77856915e760f9e2bf127c87e0cff-bbd55.pdf Accessed 20 June 2020.

37. Lui MH, Lam LW, Lee IF, Chien WT, Chau JP, Ip WY. Professional nursing values among baccalaureate nursing students in Hong Kong. Nurse Educ Today 2008; 28(1):108-114.

38. Adhikari S, Paudel K, Aro AR, Adhikari TB, Adhikari B, Mishra SR. Knowledge, attitude and practice of healthcare ethics among resident doctors and ward nurses from a resource poor setting, Nepal. BMC Medical Ethics 2016;17(1):68.

39. Tadd W, Clarke A, Lloyd L, Leino-Kilpi H, Strandell C, Lemonidou C, et al. The value of nurses' codes: European nurses' views. Nurs Ethics 2006; 13(4):376–93.

40. Farag A. Multigenerational Nursing Workforce Value Differences and Work Environment: Impact on RNs' Turnover Intentions. Doctoral Thesis. Case Western Reserve University Department of Nursing. 2008. Available at: https://etd.ohiolink.edu/!etd.send_file?accession=case1196441618&disposition=inline. Accessed 20 July 2020.

41. Nursing and Midwifery Council. The code – professional standards of practice and behavior for nurses and midwives. London: NMC; 2015.

42. Cox D, La Caze M, Levine M. Integrity. In E. N. Zalta, The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy: Metaphysics Research Lab, Stanford University; 2017.

43. Calhoun C. Standing for Something Moral Aims: Essays on the Importance of Getting It Right and Practicing Morality with Others (pp. 123-154). Oxford: Oxford University Press; 2016.

44. Ekeberg V. Mature Care and the Virtue of Integrity. Nursing Philosophy: An International Journal for Healthcare Professionals 2011; 12(2):128-138.

45. Edgar A, Pattison S. Integrity and the Moral Complexity of Professional Practice. Nursing Philosophy: An International Journal for Healthcare Professionals 2011;12(2): 94-106.

46. Mariano C. Holistic Nursing: Scope and Standards of Practice. In C. Barrere, M. A. Helming, D.A. Shields, & K. M. Avino. Holistic nursing: A handbook for practice. Seventh ed. Burlington; MA: Jones & Bartlett Learning: 2016.

47. Johnstone J. Bioethics: a nursing perspective: Elsevier Health Sciences:2016.

48. Tyreman S. Integrity: Is It Still Relevant to Modern Healthcare? Nursing Philosophy. 2011; 12(2):107-118.

49. Breakey H, Cadman T, Sampford C. Conceptualizing Personal and Institutional Integrity: The Comprehensive Integrity Framework. Research in Ethical Issues in Organizations 2015;1-40.

50. Sastrawan S, Newton JM, Malik G. Nurses' integrity and coping strategies: An integrative review. J Clin Nurs 2019; 28(5-6):733-44.

51. Beach C, SugarmanJ, JohnsonR, et al. Do patients treated with dignity report higher satisfaction, adherence and receipt of preventive care? Annals of Family Medicine 2015; 3(4): 331–338.

52. Valentine N, Darby C, Bonsel GJ. Which aspects of quality of care are most important? Results from WHO's general population surveys of 'health system responsiveness' in 41 countries. Social Science and Medicine 2008; 66:1939–1950.

53. Tadd W, Bayer T, Dieppe P. Dignity in health care: Reality or rhetoric. Reviews in Clinical Gerontology 2002; 12(1):1–4.

54. Macklin R. Dignity is a useless concept: It means no more than respect for persons or their autonomy. British Medical Journal 2003;327(7429): 1419–1420.

55. Royal College of Nursing (RCN).. Defending Dignity—Challenges and Opportunities. London: RCN;2008.

ANNEX

Table 1. Search results

Search terms (combinations)	results
nursing, values (all fields)	36991
nursing, values (title, abstract)	5937
nursing, values (title)	354
values, nursing, caring (all fields)	2312
values, nursing, caring (title, abstract)	467
values, nursing, caring (title)	3
nursing, values, deontology	9
nursing, values, deontology, caring	2
values, deontology, caring	9
nursing, deontology, caring	5
papers selected	55

Table 2. Articles analysed in the systematic review

	Author (first)	Published Year	Subtheme category	Aim
1	Kangasniemi M.	2015	*Ethical and individual values*	*To conduct an integrative review and synthesize current primary studies of professional ethics in nursing.*
2	Sibandze BT.	2018	*Ethical and individual values*	*To determine how level of education affects professional nursing values of clinical practising nurses.*
3	Moon S.	2014	*Ethical and individual values*	*To test the validity and reliability of the Korean version of the Nursing Professional Values Scale-Revised.*
4	Willis L.	2015	*Ethical and individual values*	*To determine if current education and training in nursing is focused to patient-centred, compassionate and well informed care*
5	Horton K.	2007	*Ethical and individual values*	*To determine the importance of understanding values and their relevance in nursing and how values are constructed*
6	Shahriari M.	2013	*Ethical and individual values*	*To determine and define ethical values for nurses*
7	Konishi E.	2009	*Ethical and individual values*	*To research Japanese nurses' perceptions of harmony as reflected in their everyday practice.*
8	Verpeet E.	2003	*Ethical and individual values*	*To illustrate that codes of ethics are not the only professional documents reflecting nurses' values, norms and responsibilities.*
9	Naden D.	2004	*Ethical and individual values*	*To explore when nursing becomes an art, and to develop a theory/model of nursing as art.*
10	Tarlier DS.	2004	*Ethical and individual values*	*To explore the moral and ethical foundations of nursing from the perspective of personal and public morals, and responsive nurse-patient relationships as the reflection of ethical nursing knowledge.*
11	Rchaidia L.	2009	*Ethical and individual values*	*To investigate cancer patients' perceptions of what constitutes a good nurse*
12	Shih FJ.	2009	*Ethical and individual values*	*To identify the most important contemporary professional nursing values for nursing clinicians and educators in Taiwan*
13	Weis D.	2000	*Ethical and individual values*	*To describe the Nursing Professional Values Scale (NPVS), its development, reliability and validity, and its derivation from the Code of Ethics of the American Nurses Association.*
14	Pang D.	2009	*Ethical and individual values*	*To identify the essential professional values of Chinese nurses and their manifestations in the current health-care environment.*
15	Shaw H.	2008	*Ethical and individual values*	*To determine the usefulness of an intervention integrating the core professional nursing values into academic education.*

16	Fahrenwald NL.	2005	*Ethical and individual values*	*To describe strategies for integrating and teaching core values and outline outcomes of value-based nursing education.*
17	Jormsri P.	2005	*Ethical and individual values*	*To present the derivation of moral competence in nursing practice by identifying its attributes founded on Thai culture.*
18	International Council of Nurses (2012) The ICN Code of Ethics	2012	*Ethical and individual values*	*Describe the Code of nursing ethics*
19	Canadian Nurses Association. Code of ethics for registered nurses	2017	*Ethical and individual values*	*Describe the Code of nursing ethics*
20	Nursing and Midwifery Council. The code	2018	*Ethical and individual values*	*Describe the Code of nursing ethics*
21	Code of Nursing Deontology (Greece).	2001	*Ethical and individual values*	*Describe the Code of nursing ethics*
22	Beauchamp TL.	2013	*Ethical and individual values*	*Presents the principles of biomedical ethics*
23	Hawley G.	2007	*Ethical and individual values*	*Presents an interprofessional approach of ethics in clinical practice.*
24	Baillie L.	2015	*Ethical and individual values*	*Describe the professional values in nursing*
25	Laabs C.	2011	*Ethical and individual values*	*To determine how newly graduated baccalaureate prepared nurses perceive moral integrity and how prepared they feel to manage challenges to it.*
26	Koutsouki S.	2012	*Ethical and individual values*	*Review of the factors associated with Moral Distress in nursing, its consequences and the ways of managing it.*
27	Poorchangizi B.	2017	*Ethical and individual values*	*To investigate the importance of professional values from clinical nurses' perspective.*
28	Shahriari M.	2012	*Ethical and individual values*	*To explore the perception of Iranian nurses on ethical values in patient care.*
29	Martin P.	2003	*Ethical and individual values*	*To determine the congruency in value orientation of graduating students in baccalaureate and associate degree programs.*
30	Leners DW.	2006	*Ethical and individual values*	*To track professional values over time from entry into a baccalaureate program to nursing graduation*
31	Seada A.	2012	*Ethical and individual values*	*To examine the relationship between the professional socialization process and professional nursing values that occurs among undergraduate nursing students.*
32	Bang KS.	2011	*Development of values*	*To explore South Korean nursing students' perception of nursing professional values (NPV) and compared the NPV scores between groups according to participants' demographic characteristics.*
33	Rassin RM.	2010	*Development of values*	*To measure professional and personal values among nursing students*

34	Martin P.	2003	*Development of values*	*To determine the congruency in value orientation of graduating students in baccalaureate and associate degree programs.*
35	Weis D.	2009	*Development of values*	*To examine the psychometric properties of the Nurses Professional Values Scale-Revised (NPVS-R) scale in a random sample of baccalaureate and master's students and practicing nurses.*
36	Astorino TA.	2006	*Development of values*	*To explore the professional values in graduating student nurses of traditional and accelerated nursing programs*
37	Lui MH.	2008	*Development of values*	*To examine the perceptions of 263 baccalaureate nursing students about this professional code using a cross sectional survey design.*
38	Adhikari S.	2016	*Development of values*	*To assess the current status of knowledge, attitude and practice of healthcare ethics among resident doctors and ward nurses in a tertiary teaching hospital in Nepal.*
39	Tadd W.	2006	*Development of values*	*To explore nurses' opinions of the content and function of codes and their use in nursing practice.*
40	Farag A.	2008	*Development of values*	*To describe and compare nurses' values and to evaluate the direct effect of the work environment on nurses' values and to evaluate the direct, indirect, and total effect of nurses' perceptions of their nurse manager's leadership style and work climate, and nurses' professional and generational values on nurses' intent to leave.*
41	Nursing and Midwifery Council. The code – professional standards of practice and behavior for nurses and midwives.	2015	*Integrity*	*Describe the Code of nursing ethics*
42	Cox D	2017	*Integrity*	*To describe the integrity as a multidimensional concept and its multiple interpretations.*
43	Calhoun C.	2016	*Integrity*	*Describe the two different conceptions of morality. A critical, and a reflective point of view.*
44	Ekeberg V.	2011	*Integrity*	*To explore the contribution of the virtue of integrity to the concept of mature care.*
45	Edgar A.	2011	*Integrity*	*To describe the integrity as the capacity to deliberate and reflect usefully in the light of context, knowledge, experience, and information (that of self and others) on complex and conflicting factors bearing on action or potential action.*
46	Mariano C.	2016	*Integrity*	*To describe the scope, the standards and the five core values of holistic nursing*
47	Johnstone J.	2016	*Integrity*	*Presents bioethics issues by nursing perspective*

48	Tyreman S.	2011	*Integrity*	*To explore the meaning of integrity in a multi-professional healthcare system.*
49	Breakey H.	2015	*Integrity*	*To present a conceptual and terminological model system about 'Comprehensive Integrity Framework' in personal and institutional integrity*
50	Sastrawan S.	2019	*Integrity*	*To review and synthesis the concept of integrity in nursing and identify common threats and coping strategies*
51	Beach, C.	2005	*Dignity*	*To determine whether respecting persons more broadly, such as treating them with dignity, has additional positive effects*
52	Valentine, N.	2008	*Dignity*	*To describe the relative importance of eight domains in the non-clinical quality of care concept WHO calls "health systems responsiveness".*
53	Tadd, W.	2002	*Dignity*	*To explore the meaning of dignity in healthcare*
54	Macklin, R.	2003	*Dignity*	*Presents the meaning of dignity in relation to autonomy*
55	Royal College of Nursing (RCN).	2008	*Dignity*	*To explore the perspectives of nurses, health care assistants and nursing students regarding the maintenance and promotion of dignity in everyday practice.*