

Mediterranean Marine Science

Vol 25, No 2 (2024)

Mediterranean Marine Science



Improving the sampling efficiency of benthic species and communities using complementary gears: beam trawl and bottom trawl

MARIA TERESA FARRIOLS, ALBA SERRAT, FRANCESC ORDINES, AIDA FRANK, AÍDA PAREJO, ENRIC MASSUTÍ

doi: [10.12681/mms.37470](https://doi.org/10.12681/mms.37470)

To cite this article:

FARRIOLS, M. T., SERRAT, A., ORDINES, F., FRANK, A., PAREJO, A., & MASSUTÍ, E. (2024). Improving the sampling efficiency of benthic species and communities using complementary gears: beam trawl and bottom trawl. *Mediterranean Marine Science*, 25(2), 511–531. <https://doi.org/10.12681/mms.37470>

Improving the sampling efficiency of benthic species and communities using complementary gears: beam trawl and bottom trawl

Maria Teresa FARRIOLS, Alba SERRAT, Francesc ORDINES, Aida FRANK, Aida PAREJO and Enric MASSUTÍ

Mediterranean Marine Science, 25 (2) 2024

Table S1. Mean values (Mean) and standard errors (SE) of the abundance (individuals/250 m²) by taxonomic group, depth stratum (B, 51-100 m; C, 101-200 m; D, 201-500 m and E, 501-800 m), and sampling gear (BT, Jennings beam trawl; GOC, experimental bottom trawl GOC-73). Algae and Porifera are presented in kg/250 m². Results of the paired-samples Wilcoxon test are shown (WX statistic and WX p-value). Significant differences are denoted by asterisks: * (<0.05), **(<0.01), *** (<0.001).

Stratum	Group	BT		GOC		Statistics	
		Mean A	SE	Mean A	SE	WX statistic	WX p-value
B	Algae	23.215	6.352	0.330	0.085	148	***
	Ascidiacea	67.483	45.847	0.780	0.282	80	***
	Bivalvia	15.167	4.273	0.111	0.044	30	***
	Brachiopoda	0.436	0.429	0	0	0	0.371
	Cephalopoda	0.77	0.20	0.39	0.08	589	0.264
	Cnidaria	2.44	0.69	0.07	0.02	84	**
	Crustacea	164.13	41.00	0.58	0.12	0	***
	Echinodermata	39.66	10.42	3.11	0.97	111	***
	Pisces	28.38	3.97	2.79	0.45	18	***
	Gastropoda	44.49	17.00	0.05	0.02	3	***
	Porifera	0.307	0.097	0.014	0.006	201	**
C	Algae	0	0	0	0	-	-
	Ascidiacea	1.144	0.423	0.020	0.012	70	**
	Bivalvia	32.934	27.968	0.066	0.030	11	***
	Brachiopoda	19.323	10.467	0.026	0.014	3	*
	Cephalopoda	0.355	0.066	0.798	0.282	358	0.080
	Cnidaria	6.851	3.326	0.466	0.181	70	**
	Crustacea	48.721	17.675	0.266	0.062	0	***
	Echinodermata	116.373	53.227	4.062	2.445	47	***
	Pisces	12.803	2.618	2.733	0.394	31	***
	Gastropoda	8.969	4.668	0.014	0.011	1	***
	Porifera	0.007	0.006	0.000	0.000	58	0.623
D	Algae	0	0	0	0	-	-
	Ascidiacea	0.028	0.014	0.000	0.000	1	0.106
	Bivalvia	1.712	0.416	0.001	0.000	1	***
	Brachiopoda	0.360	0.313	0.000	0.000	3	*

Continued

Table S1 continued

Stratum	Group	BT		GOC		Statistics	
		Mean A	SE	Mean A	SE	WX statistic	WX p-value
	Cephalopoda	0.364	0.078	0.297	0.053	372	0.989
	Cnidaria	0.439	0.270	0.145	0.085	169	0.445
	Crustacea	26.335	3.277	2.127	0.381	4	***
	Echinodermata	12.179	5.299	0.022	0.008	0	***
	Pisces	8.653	4.481	3.953	0.766	308	0.372
	Gastropoda	3.089	1.735	0.001	0.000	6	***
	Porifera	0.004	0.003	0.000	0.000	5	***
E	Algae	0	0	0	0	-	-
	Ascidiacea	0	0	0.000	0.000	1	1.000
	Bivalvia	0.418	0.094	0	0	0	***
	Brachiopoda	0.012	0.012	0	0	0	1.000
	Cephalopoda	0.016	0.011	0.036	0.011	192	**
	Cnidaria	0.032	0.021	0.001	0.000	15	0.726
	Crustacea	11.840	2.848	0.822	0.105	6	***
	Echinodermata	0.194	0.101	0.000	0.000	1	**
	Pisces	0.508	0.088	0.603	0.089	140	0.411
	Gastropoda	0.245	0.109	0.005	0.003	21	0.093
	Porifera	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	1	1.000

Table S2. Mean values (Mean S) and standard errors (SE) of Species richness (number of species or taxa) by taxonomic group, depth stratum (B, 51-100 m; C, 101-200 m; D, 201-500 m and E, 501-800 m) and sampling gear ('BT, Jennings beam trawl; GOC, experimental bottom trawl GOC-73). Results of the paired-samples Wilcoxon test are shown (WX statistic and WX p-value). Significant differences are denoted by asterisks: * (<0.05), **(<0.01), *** (<0.001).

Stratum	Group	BT		GOC		Statistics	
		Mean S	SE	Mean S	SE	WX statistic	WX p-value
B	Algae	5.057	0.835	5.811	1.084	412	0.551
	Ascidiacea	3.057	0.399	4.132	0.578	641	0.163
	Bivalvia	2.396	0.260	0.811	0.145	160	***
	Brachiopoda	0.057	0.042	0.000	0.000	0	0.371
	Cephalopoda	0.792	0.102	5.075	0.207	1431	***
	Cnidaria	1.113	0.192	1.245	0.184	383	0.635
	Crustacea	14.925	0.721	5.623	0.379	15.5	***
	Echinodermata	5.887	0.531	6.075	0.438	606.5	0.853
	Pisces	7.774	0.406	16.623	0.606	1355	***
	Gastropoda	3.396	0.316	1.245	0.159	43.5	***
	Porifera	3.679	0.668	1.774	0.281	263.5	0.030
C	Algae	0	0	0	0	-	-
	Ascidiacea	0.656	0.153	0.688	0.158	154	0.917
	Bivalvia	2.063	0.205	0.469	0.119	21	***
	Brachiopoda	0.250	0.090	0.188	0.070	7	0.484
	Cephalopoda	0.906	0.151	6.156	0.242	528	***
	Cnidaria	1.281	0.243	1.281	0.243	95.5	1.000
	Crustacea	13.656	0.806	4.219	0.559	0	***
	Echinodermata	5.781	0.582	4.188	0.403	117	*
	Pisces	8.469	0.759	18.844	0.743	492.5	***
	Gastropoda	3.063	0.345	0.344	0.096	5	***
	Porifera	0.750	0.336	0.531	0.142	56	0.846
D	Algae	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	-	-
	Ascidiacea	0.132	0.067	0.026	0.026	2.5	0.203
	Bivalvia	1.553	0.187	0.132	0.056	4.5	***
	Brachiopoda	0.158	0.060	0.053	0.037	9	0.181
	Cephalopoda	0.763	0.110	6.711	0.258	741	***
	Cnidaria	0.395	0.096	0.684	0.107	247	*
	Crustacea	15.132	0.860	10.553	0.799	156.5	**
	Echinodermata	3.605	0.429	1.789	0.309	71	***
	Pisces	5.184	0.381	20.342	0.567	741	***
	Gastropoda	2.184	0.301	0.395	0.110	33	***
	Porifera	0.500	0.098	0.132	0.077	33	*
E	Algae	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	-	-
	Ascidiacea	0.000	0.000	0.048	0.048	1	1.000
	Bivalvia	1.048	0.176	0.000	0.000	0	***
	Brachiopoda	0.048	0.048	0.000	0.000	0	1.000
	Cephalopoda	0.095	0.066	3.095	0.275	231	***
	Cnidaria	0.143	0.078	0.238	0.095	22.5	0.529
	Crustacea	10.571	1.061	12.095	0.768	130.5	0.349
	Echinodermata	0.619	0.146	0.095	0.066	5	**

Continued

Table S2 continued

Stratum	Group	BT		GOC		Statistics	
		Mean S	SE	Mean S	SE	WX statistic	WX p-value
	Pisces	2.381	0.355	14.714	0.694	231	***
	Gastropoda	0.476	0.164	0.476	0.148	32	0.963
	Porifera	0.048	0.048	0.048	0.048	1.5	1.000

Table S3. Results of SIMPER analysis, estimated from standardized biomass data showing mean biomass (B, g/250 m²) and percentage contribution (%C) of each taxon contributing up to 90% of within-group similarity by depth stratum, and sampler (BT, Jennings beam trawl; GOC, experimental bottom trawl GOC-73).

Stratum	Taxa	BT		Taxa	GOC	
		B	%C		B	%C
B (51-100 m)	Corallinaceae	8436.21	20.61	<i>Scyliorhinus canicula</i>	26.06	12.12
	<i>Turritellinella tricarinata</i>	20.31	9.44	<i>Octopus vulgaris</i>	27.42	11.69
	<i>Citharus linguatula</i>	7.99	7.8	<i>Mullus barbatus</i>	12.25	9.48
	<i>Lithothamnion valens</i>	2903.55	6.71	<i>Illex coindetii</i>	4.3	9.05
	<i>Arnoglossus laterna</i>	4.64	6.47	<i>Merluccius merluccius</i>	3.93	7.69
	<i>Astropecten irregularis</i>	2.9	2.81	<i>Spatangus purpureus</i>	181.82	6.18
	<i>Neopycnodonte cochlear</i>	87.79	2.71	<i>Pagellus erythrinus</i>	7.7	5.28
	<i>Peyssonnelia</i> spp.	2329.15	2.57	<i>Trisopterus minutus</i>	3.76	4.32
	<i>Spongites fruticulosus</i>	3072.63	2.46	<i>Lophius budegassa</i>	3.97	4.19
	<i>Phyllophora crispa</i>	581.7	2.24	Corallinaceae	39.49	2.85
	<i>Serranus hepatus</i>	7.94	2.07	<i>Mullus surmuletus</i>	16.25	2.13
	<i>Symphurus nigrescens</i>	2.19	2.04	<i>Parastichopus regalis</i>	2.09	2
	<i>Phymatolithon calcareum</i>	1265.15	2.04	<i>Serranus cabrilla</i>	9.3	1.65
	<i>Polybius depurator</i>	3.03	1.94	<i>Lithothamnion valens</i>	27.61	1.59
	<i>Lesueurigobius friesii</i>	1.62	1.94	<i>Spongites fruticulosus</i>	21.79	1.48
	<i>Alpheus glaber</i>	1.29	1.93	<i>Osmundaria volubilis</i>	51.66	1.2
	<i>Lepidotrigla cavillone</i>	3.9	1.81	<i>Chelidonichthys lastoviza</i>	8.33	1.01
	<i>Osmundaria volubilis</i>	678.8	1.63	<i>Halopteris filicina</i>	14.65	0.9
	<i>Lithothamnion corallioides</i>	1508.86	1.54	<i>Raja clavata</i>	4.99	0.75
	<i>Ascidia mentula</i>	44.49	1.23	<i>Pagellus acarne</i>	16.24	0.75
	<i>Parastichopus regalis</i>	17.42	1.15	<i>Trachinus draco</i>	2.33	0.75
	<i>Halopteris filicina</i>	281.96	1.01	<i>Serranus hepatus</i>	2.01	0.7
	<i>Alcyonium palmatum</i>	3.31	0.97	<i>Sphaerechinus granularis</i>	16.82	0.67
	<i>Parapenaeus longirostris</i>	1.44	0.93	<i>Phyllophora crispa</i>	20.31	0.64
	<i>Solenocera membranacea</i>	0.75	0.87	<i>Codium bursa</i>	7.25	0.62
	<i>Goneplax rhomboides</i>	0.61	0.81	<i>Laminaria rodriguezii</i>	60.04	0.57
<i>Ascidella</i> spp.	8.28	0.77				
<i>Dardanus arrosor</i>	18.59	0.66				
<i>Trisopterus minutus</i>	0.91	0.53				
<i>Aegaeon cataphractus</i>	0.73	0.51				
C (101-200 m)	<i>Parastichopus regalis</i>	20.61	17.21	<i>Scyliorhinus canicula</i>	16.5	18.65
	<i>Gracilechinus acutus</i>	27.9	12.18	<i>Raja clavata</i>	21.93	16.78
	<i>Leptometra phalangium</i>	131.59	9.82	<i>Merluccius merluccius</i>	11.81	13.28
	<i>Parapenaeus longirostris</i>	8.5	8.51	<i>Illex coindetii</i>	9.62	11.08
	<i>Gryphus vitreus</i>	105.38	8.31	<i>Chelidonichthys cuculus</i>	8.7	6.95

Continued

Table S3 continued

Stratum	BT			GOC		
	Taxa	B	%C	Taxa	B	%C
	<i>Lesueurigobius friesii</i>	5.28	4.28	<i>Mullus barbatus</i>	6.13	4.48
	<i>Symphurus nigrescens</i>	3.21	3.9	<i>Lophius budegassa</i>	4.44	2.93
	<i>Astropecten irregularis</i>	3.55	3.54	<i>Parastichopus regalis</i>	8.16	2.82
	<i>Asciidiella</i> spp.	5.55	3.01	<i>Zeus faber</i>	4.03	2.43
	<i>Serranus hepatus</i>	5.45	2.53	<i>Mullus surmuletus</i>	4.83	2.02
	<i>Arnoglossus laterna</i>	1.69	1.79	<i>Leucoraja naevus</i>	4.45	1.61
	<i>Lophius budegassa</i>	7.75	1.38	<i>Serranus hepatus</i>	2.38	1.51
	<i>Chlorotocus crassicornis</i>	0.98	1.35	<i>Trisopterus minutus</i>	2.1	1.2
	<i>Alpheus glaber</i>	0.87	1.27	<i>Gracilechinus acutus</i>	4.84	1.18
	<i>Solenocera membranacea</i>	1.03	1.26	<i>Octopus vulgaris</i>	2.23	1.18
	<i>Neopycnodonte cochlear</i>	290.73	1.22	<i>Serranus cabrilla</i>	2.03	0.9
	<i>Callionymus maculatus</i>	0.78	1.11	<i>Trachinus draco</i>	1.3	0.82
	<i>Funiculina quadrangularis</i>	6.76	1.04	<i>Scaevurgus unicolorrhus</i>	0.89	0.81
	<i>Citharus linguatula</i>	2.28	1.0			
	<i>Alcyonium palmatum</i>	3.22	0.95			
	<i>Anapagurus laevis</i>	4.76	0.74			
	<i>Xenophora crispa</i>	4.51	0.74			
	<i>Tethyaster subinermis</i>	6.4	0.73			
	<i>Arnoglossus rueppelii</i>	1.16	0.72			
	<i>Goneplax rhomboides</i>	0.4	0.63			
	<i>Lophogaster typicus</i>	0.46	0.55			
	<i>Trisopterus minutus</i>	1.48	0.54			
D (201-500 m)	<i>Parapenaeus longirostris</i>	7.03	26.3	<i>Scyliorhinus canicula</i>	16.27	29.37
	<i>Plesionika heterocarpus</i>	3.86	12.19	<i>Phycis blennoides</i>	5.32	11.27
	<i>Chlorotocus crassicornis</i>	3.48	9.89	<i>Illex coindetii</i>	10.63	9.48
	<i>Symphurus nigrescens</i>	2.31	4.16	<i>Parapenaeus longirostris</i>	3.12	6.12
	<i>Gadiculus argenteus</i>	7.52	3.95	<i>Gadiculus argenteus</i>	6.38	4.61
	<i>Nephrops norvegicus</i>	0.95	2.44	<i>Coelorinchus caelorhincus</i>	4.77	3.92
	<i>Brissopsis lyrifera</i>	4.2	2.42	<i>Merluccius merluccius</i>	4.03	3.88
	<i>Goneplax rhomboides</i>	0.79	2.39	<i>Raja clavata</i>	7.87	3.17
	<i>Alpheus glaber</i>	1.03	2.21	<i>Micromesistius poutassou</i>	14	2.65
	<i>Lepidorhombus boscii</i>	2.26	2.15	<i>Helicolenus dactylopterus</i>	7.58	2.58
	<i>Solenocera membranacea</i>	0.48	2.08	<i>Galeus melastomus</i>	3.82	2.46
	<i>Monodaeus couchii</i>	0.64	1.75	<i>Lophius budegassa</i>	2.91	2.43
	<i>Astropecten irregularis</i>	1	1.66	<i>Nephrops norvegicus</i>	1.44	2.05
	<i>Scyliorhinus canicula</i>	3.17	1.61	<i>Eledone cirrhosa</i>	1.45	1.69
	<i>Phycis blennoides</i>	2.61	1.44	<i>Plesionika heterocarpus</i>	2.38	1.52
	<i>Processa canaliculata</i>	0.46	1.4	<i>Lepidorhombus boscii</i>	1.26	1.29
	<i>Euspira fusca</i>	0.46	1.34	<i>Chlorophthalmus agassizi</i>	4.54	1.29
	<i>Parastichopus regalis</i>	9.61	1.32	<i>Trigla lyra</i>	7.51	1.2
	<i>Dardanus arrosor</i>	1.68	1.15			
	<i>Aporrhais serresiana</i>	0.64	1.1			
	<i>Iridonida speciosa</i>	1.8	1.07			
	<i>Plesionika gigliolii</i>	1.11	1.06			

Continued

Table S3 continued

Stratum	BT			GOC		
	Taxa	B	%C	Taxa	B	%C
	<i>Gaidropsarus biscayensis</i>	0.53	1.01			
	<i>Macropipus tuberculatus</i>	0.68	0.95			
	<i>Thenaea muricata</i>	3.46	0.86			
	<i>Calocaris macandreae</i>	0.47	0.83			
	<i>Lophogaster typicus</i>	0.45	0.73			
	<i>Aegaeon lacazei</i>	0.23	0.69			
E (501-800 m)	<i>Geryon longipes</i>	11.61	49.34	<i>Galeus melastomus</i>	29.44	53.78
	<i>Calocaris macandreae</i>	2.58	10.97	<i>Phycis blennoides</i>	5.17	11.12
	<i>Polycheles typhlops</i>	1.14	7.22	<i>Geryon longipes</i>	5.85	10.12
	<i>Gaidropsarus biscayensis</i>	0.39	4.02	<i>Aristeus antennatus</i>	2.09	6.42
	<i>Phycis blennoides</i>	2.97	3.48	<i>Todarodes sagittatus</i>	3.26	3.62
	<i>Nezumia aequalis</i>	1.31	3.3	<i>Plesionika martia</i>	1.3	2.35
	<i>Aristeus antennatus</i>	1.22	2.65	<i>Etmopterus spinax</i>	1	1.76
	<i>Monodaeus couchii</i>	0.9	2.46	<i>Conger conger</i>	1.09	1.72
	<i>Plesionika acanthonotus</i>	0.44	2.03			
	<i>Pagurus alatus</i>	0.36	1.87			
	<i>Parapenaeus longirostris</i>	1	1.81			
	<i>Plesionika martia</i>	0.54	1.44			

Table S4. ANOSIM results comparing the composition of the Jennings beam trawl samples and the experimental bottom trawl GOC-73 samples by depth stratum (B, 51-100 m; C, 101-200 m; D, 201-500 m and E, 501-800 m). Significant differences are denoted by asterisks: * (<0.05), **(<0.01), *** (<0.001).

Stratum	R Statistic	Significance Level	Possible Permutations	Actual Permutations	Number >= Observed
B	0.47	***	Very large	999	0
C	0.577	***	Very large	999	0
D	0.552	***	Very large	999	0
E	0.488	***	Very large	999	0